Impact of Nucleoside Reverse Transcriptase Inhibitors on Mitochondria in Human Immunodeficiency Virus Type 1-Infected Children Receiving Highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy

Akihiko Saitoh,* Terence Fenton, Carmelita Alvero, Courtney V. Fletcher, and Stephen A. Spector

Division of Infectious Diseases, Department of Pediatrics, University of California San Diego, La Jolla, California; Center for Molecular Genetics, Center for AIDS Research, Harvard School of Public Health, Boston, Massachusetts; and Center for Biostatistics in AIDS Research, 3 Center for AIDS Research, 5 Center for AIDS Research, 2 Center for AIDS Research, 1 Center for AIDS Research, 2

Received 6 July 2007/Returned for modification 7 August 2007/Accepted 11 September 2007

Mitochondrial toxicity induced by nucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors (NRTIs) has been reported to be responsible for various adverse effects. The relative impact of NRTIs on the mitochondria of human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) type 1 (HIV-1)-infected children receiving highly active antiretroviral therapy (HAART) is unknown. Mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) levels were quantified longitudinally from peripheral blood mononuclear cells (PBMCs) in 31 HIV-1-infected children from Pediatric AIDS Clinical Trial Group Study 382 who were receiving HAART, including nelfinavir, efavirenz, and different NRTIs, and who had had undetectable plasma HIV-1 RNA levels for >2 years. The median mtDNA levels in PBMCs increased from 137 copies/cell at the baseline to 179 copies/cell at week 48 (P = 0.01) and 198 copies/cell at week 104 (P < 0.001). Before the initiation of HAART, children who received regimens containing didanosine had mtDNA levels persistently lower than those in children not receiving didanosine (106 versus 140 copies/cell; P = 0.008). During HAART, the median increase in the mtDNA level from the baseline to week 104 was the lowest in children who received regimens containing didanosine (+26 copies/cell) compared to those in children who received other regimens (+79 copies/cell) (P = 0.02). A multivariate analysis also demonstrated that didanosine, as part of HAART, was the only NRTI associated with the change in mtDNA levels (P = 0.007).

Children receiving didanosine-containing antiretroviral regimens have the lowest mtDNA levels in PBMCs and may be at greater risk for long-term adverse effects due to mitochondrial toxicity. This may be of particular importance in resource-limited countries where didanosine is widely used for the treatment of HIV-infected children.

The morbidity and mortality associated with human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) type 1 (HIV-1) infection of children have improved dramatically with the availability of highly active antiretroviral therapy (HAART) (22, 47). Along with the clear benefits of HAART, important adverse effects of antiretrovirals are increasingly being recognized (5). In some patients, these side effects require the discontinuation or a change of the antiretroviral therapy.

In combination with protease inhibitors (PIs) or nonnucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors (NNRTIs), nucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors (NRTIs) remain the backbone for many HAART regimens. NRTIs have been shown to deplete mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) by selectively inhibiting DNA polymerase γ (28, 30), which is crucial for the replication of mtDNA. The depletion of mtDNA, which causes mitochondrial dysfunction, is at least partly responsible for various NRTI-associated adverse effects (21).

The “gold standard” for the diagnosis of mitochondrial toxicity is examination of biopsy materials from muscle, liver, or nerve; however, the collection of these biopsy specimens is not practical, especially for vulnerable children. Peripheral blood mononuclear cells (PBMCs) are easily obtained from patients, and several reports have suggested clinical correlations between toxicity and the mtDNA levels in the PBMCs of HIV-infected adults receiving antiretroviral therapy (11, 17, 18, 31, 34). In contrast, no clinical correlations between the mtDNA levels in PBMCs and lipodystrophy, lactate levels, or the toxicities of antiretroviral regimens have been identified (9, 24, 32, 38, 41, 48). The clinical use of the assay for mtDNA levels in PBMCs is still controversial (3, 45); therefore, more research is required to elucidate the importance of the mtDNA levels in PBMCs in the clinical setting, especially for children for whom the levels of sample materials are limited.

Children may be more vulnerable than adults to the adverse effects of antiretrovirals because of the potential negative impact on growth and development with their long-term exposure (33); however, information regarding the frequency and severity of long-term adverse effects in children is limited. In addition, only one cross-sectional study that has examined mtDNA levels in the PBMCs of children receiving antiretroviral therapy is available (14). That study showed no difference in mitochondrial function and mitochondrial content in PBMCs between children with lipodystrophy and those without lipodystrophy.
In order to optimize current and future antiretroviral therapies, there is an urgent need to determine not only which regimens provide sustained virologic and immunologic benefits but also those interventions that are the least likely to produce long-term toxicity. We investigated the effect of specific NRTIs given in combination with an NNRTI (efavirenz) and a PI (nelfinavir) on mtDNA levels in the PBMCs of a cohort of children who achieved sustained virologic suppression.

This study was presented in part at the 12th Conference on Retroviruses and Opportunistic Infections, Denver, CO, 5 to 9 February 2005, poster 696.)

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

**Subjects.** Thirty-one children (median age, 5.6 years; age range, 3.2 to 16.8 years) who were a subset of Pediatric AIDS Clinical Trial Group (PACTG) Study 382, which consisted of treatment with efavirenz, nelfinavir, and one or two NRTIs, participated in this study. They were selected because they had achieved persistent and undetectable plasma HIV-1 RNA levels while receiving HAART (44). All 31 patients reached undetectable HIV-1 RNA levels up to week 104. Before they were enrolled in the study, children were PI and NNRTI treatment naïve, but they could be NRTI experienced and were NRTI experienced as follows: 6% (n = 2) had received one NRTI and 91% (n = 28) had received two NRTIs. One child (3%) was antiretroviral naïve. The NRTI regimens that the children received during the study were either continued (32%; n = 10) or changed (68%; n = 21), based on the clinical judgment of the primary care physicians (Table 1). Informed consent was obtained from the study participants and their legal guardians. This study followed the human experimentation guidelines of the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services and the University of California San Diego review board.

**Quantification of mtDNA and nDNA by real-time PCR.** mtDNA and nuclear DNA (nDNA) were quantified by real-time PCR with a LightCycler instrument (Roche Applied Science, Indianapolis, IN), as described previously (17). The results are expressed as the ratio of the mean mtDNA level (in numbers of copies per cell) to the mean nDNA level for a given extract, in duplicate. The ratios were quantified at the baseline and at weeks 2, 4, 8, 48, and 104 after the initiation of HAART.

**Measurement of HIV-1 intracellular DNA, plasma HIV-1 RNA, and CD4⁺ T-lymphocyte counts and percentages.** HIV-1 intracellular DNA (HIV-1 DNA) and HIV-1 RNA levels were quantified by using the Amplicor Monitor HIV-1 DNA assay and the standard and ultrasensitive Amplicor HIV-1 Monitor assay (version 1.0) (12, 44, 46), respectively (Roche Molecular Systems, Alameda, CA). The absolute numbers and percentages of CD4⁺ T lymphocytes were determined in PACTG-certified laboratories by flow cytometry.

**RESULTS**

**Impact of NRTI regimens on mtDNA levels before initiation of HAART.** The children were divided into two groups on the basis of their use of ddI before enrolling the study: regimens containing no ddI (n = 20) and regimens containing ddI (n = 10) (Table 2). The median mtDNA level was significantly decreased in children who received regimens containing ddI (106 copies/cell; range, 76 to 176 copies/cell) compared with the level in those who did not receive ddI (140 copies/cell; range, 110 to 431 copies/cell) (P = 0.008). Notably, patients who received the ddI and d4T combination (n = 2) had the lowest mtDNA levels (76 and 92 copies/cell). Of note, the background characteristics among the two groups did not differ significantly by age (P = 0.98), sex (P = 0.76), race/ethnicity (P = 0.85), the duration of therapy (P = 0.40), plasma HIV-1 RNA levels (P = 0.17), or CD4⁺ T-lymphocyte counts (P = 0.17).
0.20). In addition, the distribution of the NRTI switch (ddI-containing regimens versus non-ddI-containing regimens) before and after the study was not significantly different ($P = 0.68$) (Table 1). No difference in mtDNA levels were observed at the baseline between children who received ZDV and those who did not receive ZDV ($P = 0.51$) or between children who received ddI and those who did not receive ddI ($P = 0.16$) before HAART; however, children who received 3TC ($n = 21$) had higher mtDNA levels than those who did not receive 3TC ($n = 10$) ($P = 0.003$). Of note, among the 21 patients who received 3TC, only 1 patient (4.8%) received ddI, reflecting the difference in the mtDNA levels in children who did or who did not receive ddI and not a specific beneficial effect of 3TC.

mtDNA levels increase during HAART in children with sustained virologic suppression. Overall, the median mtDNA levels increased from 137 copies/cell (interquartile range [IQR], 115 to 171 copies/cell) at the baseline to 179 copies/cell (IQR, 166 to 290 copies/cell) at week 104 ($P < 0.001$).

Changes in mtDNA levels in children receiving ddI in combination with HAART regimens are least increased compared to those in children receiving other NRTIs. We next examined the data on the basis of the use of ddI during HAART: (i) children who received ddI ($n = 7$) and (ii) children who did not receive ddI ($n = 24$). The background characteristics between the two groups were similar by age ($P = 0.60$), gender ($P = 0.56$), race/ethnicity ($P = 0.20$), HIV-1 RNA levels ($P = 0.27$), CD4+ T-cell counts ($P = 0.23$), and mtDNA levels at the baseline ($P = 0.70$). The median changes in mtDNA levels from the baseline to week 48 in children receiving ddI (+16 copies/cell) was lower than those in children not receiving ddI (+57 copies/cell) ($P = 0.20$). Furthermore, the median changes in mtDNA levels from the baseline to week 104 in children receiving ddI were significantly lower (+26 copies/cell) than those in children not receiving ddI (+79 copies/cell) ($P = 0.02$) (Fig. 1).

When children were divided on the basis of the use of ZDV, 3TC, and ddI during HAART, we found no significant difference in the changes in mtDNA levels from the baseline to week 48 ($P = 0.14$ to 0.65). However, at week 104, children receiving ZDV (+101 copies/cell) had the highest increases in mtDNA levels compared to the levels in those not receiving ZDV (+52 copies/cell) ($P = 0.03$) (Fig. 1). No difference in mtDNA levels was observed in children receiving 3TC and those not receiving 3TC (+85 copies/cell versus +51 copies/cell; $P = 0.30$) (Fig. 1). In contrast, children receiving ddI (+51 copies/cell) experienced marginally lower mtDNA increases compared to those in children not receiving ddI (+98 copies/cell) ($P = 0.06$) (Fig. 1).

We also analyzed the data on the basis of the combination of the NRTIs that were part of a child’s HAART regimen. The subjects were divided into four groups: (i) those receiving ddI, (ii) those receiving ZDV plus 3TC, (iii) those receiving d4T plus 3TC, and (iv) those receiving ddI-containing regimens. Although no significant differences in the change in mtDNA levels were observed from the baseline to week 48 ($P = 0.40$), at week 104, the changes in mtDNA levels differed significantly between children who received ZDV plus 3TC (+127 copies/cell; $n = 7$) and those who received ddI-containing regimens.
correlation between the mtDNA levels and the HIV-1 DNA levels ($r = -0.29; P < 0.001; n = 173$). When the correlation was evaluated at each week, no correlation was seen at the baseline ($r = -0.10; P = 0.60$); however, there were significant negative correlations between the mtDNA levels and the HIV-1 DNA levels at week 2 ($r = -0.44; P = 0.02$) and week 4 ($r = -0.43; P = 0.02$). No correlations were seen during the rest of the study visits, at week 5 ($r = 0.19; P = 0.32$), week 48 ($r = -0.19; P = 0.35$), and week 104 ($r = -0.25; P = 0.19$).

### mtDNA levels and plasma HIV-1 RNA levels and CD4+ T-cell counts

Although HIV-1 infection itself appears to lower the mtDNA contents of PBMCs in antiretroviral-agent-naïve patients (6, 11, 36), in our study, no correlations were observed between the mtDNA and the HIV-1 RNA levels at the baseline and weeks 2 and 4 ($r = -0.29$ to $-0.34; P = 0.06$ to 0.91) when the majority of subjects had detectable plasma HIV-1 RNA. In addition, no correlations were observed between the mtDNA levels and the CD4+ T-cell counts at any study visit ($P = 0.06$ to 0.64).

### mtDNA levels and physical parameters, lipid profiles, adverse effects, and age

No significant correlations were seen between the mtDNA levels and (i) the changes in BMIs ($P = 0.84$) or z scores ($P = 0.24$) at week 48 and the changes in BMIs ($P = 0.24$) or z scores ($P = 0.68$) at week 104 and (ii) fasting lipid profiles, including the cholesterol ($P = 0.15$), triglyceride ($P = 0.68$), high-density lipoprotein ($P = 0.87$), and low-density lipoprotein ($P = 0.06$) levels at week 104. Six adverse events in five children were reported as grade 3 or greater, including neutropenia ($n = 3$), hepatitis ($n = 2$), and thrombocytopenia ($n = 1$), during HAART. The mtDNA levels in children who experienced adverse effects were not different from the ones in children who did not experience the adverse effects each week ($P = 0.33$ to 0.74). Furthermore, no correlations were observed between age and the mtDNA levels at the baseline ($P = 0.15$), the changes in mtDNA levels from the baseline to week 48 ($P = 0.67$), and the changes in mtDNA levels from the baseline to week 104 ($P = 0.87$).

### DISCUSSION

We have shown that ddI-containing HAART regimens are associated with the greatest degree of mtDNA suppression in PBMCs compared to those achieved by regimens not containing ddI in HIV-1-infected children who sustained undetectable HIV-1 RNA levels during HAART.

To our knowledge, the current study is the first longitudinal evaluation of mtDNA levels in the PBMCs of HIV-1-infected children.

### TABLE 3. Multivariate analyses of mtDNA changes from the baseline to week 104

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Covariate</th>
<th>Regression coefficient ± SE</th>
<th>$P$ value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>2.3000 ± 0.5491</td>
<td>0.0003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age (yr)</td>
<td>0.0071 ± 0.0117</td>
<td>0.5599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex (male)</td>
<td>0.0043 ± 0.0811</td>
<td>0.6235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race (African American)</td>
<td>0.1406 ± 0.0793</td>
<td>0.0884</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baseline mtDNA (log copies/cell)</td>
<td>-1.0121 ± 0.2534</td>
<td>0.0005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ddI use</td>
<td>-0.2782 ± 0.0946</td>
<td>0.0070</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* SE, standard error.
children receiving HAART. We demonstrated a gradual increase in mtDNA levels in the PBMCs of children who sustained undetectable HIV-1 RNA levels during HAART, which is also supported by the data achieved in studies with adults (8). Our current study was able to control for several important factors compared to those used in other longitudinal studies (17, 24, 34, 38, 41, 48) and cross-sectional studies (9, 11, 15, 18, 32) with adults that could potentially affect the mtDNA levels in PBMCs. First, we selected children with sustained undetectable HIV-1 RNA levels during HAART, decreasing the likelihood that patients with detectable HIV-1 RNA can significantly reduce the mtDNA content of PBMCs (6, 11, 36). Second, although the majority of previous studies have shown the lack of an association between the mtDNA levels in PBMCs and lipodystrophy (9, 11, 14, 24, 32, 38, 41, 48), the children in our study did not have obvious symptoms or signs of lipodystrophy. Third, among the previously published studies and this study, our study had the longest period of observation of patients receiving HAART (up to 104 weeks). Finally, although the effects of PI and NNRTIs combined with NRTIs on the mtDNA levels in PBMCs are unknown, our cohort of children received the same combination of a PI (nevirapine) and an NNRTI (efavirenz), with only the NRTI being different. Thus, having controlled for the PI and NNRTI treatment background, we were able to differentiate the effects of specific NRTIs on mtDNA levels.

Clinically, d4T and ddI are known to be associated with higher incidences of adverse effects in HIV-1-infected patients receiving antiretroviral therapy. Cross-sectional studies with adults have suggested that subjects receiving d4T in combination with ddI experience low mtDNA levels in PBMCs compared to the levels in those receiving other regimens (11, 18). This clinical observation is supported by in vitro studies illustrating that the inhibition of DNA polymerase γ in association with mitochondrial toxicity is differentially affected by NRTIs: d4T = ddI > 3TC > tenofovir > ZDV (25, 28). In our current study with children, ddl was the most important determinant of mitochondrial toxicity, as defined by the lowest mtDNA levels before and during HAART. These findings were also confirmed by multivariate analyses that controlled for other confounding factors, including d4T use.

In contrast, the mtDNA levels in children receiving a ZDV-containing regimen (ZDV plus 3TC) were significantly increased compared to those in children receiving other NRTI regimens. Similarly, although the duration of therapy is only 6 weeks for infants receiving ZDV to prevent the mother-to-child transmission of HIV-1, mtDNA levels have been observed to increase in the PBMCs of infants who are exposed to ZDV perinatally (1, 16). The mechanisms of increase in mtDNA levels are still unknown, but our in vitro data indicate that the mtDNA levels in human skeletal muscle myoblasts treated with ZDV show the highest increase compared to those in untreated cells or cells treated with different NRTIs when the cells were incubated for 2 days (43). These findings are also consistent with the increase in mtDNA levels observed with ZDV in other in vitro models, including human hepatoblastoma (HepG2) cells (20) and human skeletal muscle cells (2). In total, these results strongly suggest that ZDV upregulates genes encoding mtDNA. Because ZDV has been reported to cause significant mitochondrial toxicity in different in vitro models (23), this may reflect a compensatory response to mitochondrial dysfunction caused by a different pathway. Importantly, an increase in mtDNA does not necessarily mean an increase in mitochondrial function; several studies have shown inhibition of the respiratory function by NRTIs independently through mtDNA polymerase γ (29), oxidative stress (26), and increases in mtDNA levels and mitochondrial mass by oxidative stress (27, 51). In addition, treatment with NRTIs, including 3TC, abacavir, emtricitabine, and tenofovir, which are known to be less toxic to mitochondria, have been shown to result in increases in mtDNA levels in HepG2 cells (20), human skeletal muscle cells (2), and lymphoblasts (40). Further studies are needed to delineate the mechanisms associated with changes in mtDNA levels by NRTIs and mitochondrial function and the clinical significance of an increase in PBMC mtDNA levels.

In a recent study with adults, d4T and ddI use was associated with fat mtDNA depletion, whereas ddl exposure was the only observed association with mtDNA depletion in PBMCs (10). In an in vitro model, the thymidine analogues, including d4T and ZDV, but not ddl, decreased mitochondrial activity and cell survival in adipose tissue (4). In contrast, ddl significantly decreased the mtDNA content in neuronal cells (19), human hepatoma cell lines (37, 50), and human skeletal muscle cells (2), whereas no significant change in mtDNA levels was observed with d4T, ZDV, or 3TC. In our preliminary studies with human skeletal muscle myoblasts, ddl significantly decreased mtDNA levels as well as mtRNA levels (43). In summary, the currently available data show that the effects of NRTIs on mitochondria seem to differ in different tissues. Therefore, the evaluation of mtDNA in future studies should include the possible anatomical sites where adverse effects are potentially the greatest.

Our findings also showed a negative correlation between mtDNA and HIV-1 DNA levels in PBMCs during the early stages of HAART. Although our data clearly showed that ddl-containing regimens can alter mtDNA levels, the negative effect of ddi may be masked by the beneficial effect of decreasing intracellular virus levels during the early stage of HAART. Our finding that the mtDNA levels no longer correlated with the HIV-1 DNA levels during prolonged HAART suggests that at steady state the use of a specific NRTI has a greater impact on the mtDNA levels than relatively small differences in HIV-1 DNA levels. Interestingly, the correlations between the mtDNA and the HIV-1 DNA levels were not observed at the baseline, which likely reflects the failure of mono-NRTI or dual NRTI therapy to suppress viral replication in the study participants.

Although improved growth is usually associated with effective HAART in HIV-1-infected children (35, 49), the changes in the mtDNA levels in PBMCs did not correlate with changes in BMIs or z scores, suggesting that the degree of mitochondrial toxicity did not affect the growth of the children over the 104 weeks of effective HAART. However, no measurement of peripheral or visceral fat was performed to determine the presence or absence of lipodystrophy in this study; therefore, the ability of the mtDNA levels in PBMCs to predict lipodystrophy was not possible.

We appreciate that there are several potential limitations of the current study. First, the number of children evaluated was
relatively small; a larger cohort may help to define the impact of low mtDNA levels on HIV-infected children. Second, we quantified the mtDNA levels in PBMCs containing different cells at different stages of activation, during which it has been reported that the levels of mtDNA change (7). Third, it has been suggested that platelet contamination of PBMCs could be a potential factor confounding mtDNA levels (13), and this possibility was not investigated in the current study. Finally, although we showed that ddI significantly affects the mtDNA levels in PBMCs in children, it is still unknown how well the mtDNA levels in PBMCs reflect the mtDNA levels at other anatomical sites in vivo. In addition, information regarding the mtDNA levels in PBMCs in healthy children is limited (16, 42). Thus, future research should focus on the impact of mtDNA levels in PBMCs on physical growth, peripheral or visceral fat levels, muscle mass, toxicity, and neurodevelopmental progress in children.

In conclusion, we have shown that ddI has a significant impact on the mtDNA levels found in the PBMCs of children with sustained vireologic suppression during HAART. Our findings that ddI is associated with the greatest suppression of mtDNA are of particular importance in resource-limited countries where ddI is a common component of antiretroviral therapy (39, 52). A prospective study is urgently needed to elucidate the long-term clinical significance of mtDNA levels in children and the NRTI regimens causing the least mitochondrial toxicity.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We acknowledge the PACTG sites and study participants for their time and dedication to these studies. This study was supported by the Pediatric AIDS Clinical Trials Group, the International Maternal Perinatal Adolescent AIDS Clinical Trial (IMPAACT) Network (grant AI066632), and grants from the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases (grant 5K23AI-50931 to A. S. Ray and K. J. Craib, C. S. Alexander, B. Wynhoven, L. Ting, H. Wong, M. Harris, P. R. Harrigan, M. V. O’Shaughnessy, and J. S. Montaner). Changes in mtDNA content as a marker of nucleoside toxicity in HIV-infected patients with lipodystrophy. Antivir. Ther. 8:315–321.


Martin, J. L., C. E. Brown, N. Matthews-Davis, and J. E. Reardon. 1994. Effects of antiviral nucleoside analogs on human DNA polymerases and

REFERENCES


